

From: s47F
To: [Minister Hunt](#)
Cc: [MURPHY, Brendan](#); senator.antic@aph.gov.au
Subject: Definition of a woman and Senator Antic
Date: Friday, 15 April 2022 1:01:10 PM

REMINDER: Think before you click! This email originated from outside our organisation. Only click links or open attachments if you recognise the sender and know the content is safe.

Dear Mr Hunt,

I am writing to request that, as health minister, you inform Senator Antic that his behaviour in Senate estimates was ignorant and disgraceful. Dr Murphy, the chief medical officer was quite correct that the definition is a complex and a serious and rather subjective one and to sit laughing and smirking is arrogant and ignorant.

For example - 1) is the definition of a woman having two X chromosomes? If so where does that leave people with Turner's syndrome who appear as females outwardly (phenotype) but lack a complete second X chromosome?

2) what about Androgen insensitivity syndrome? Affected people are genetically male (XY chromosomes) but are resistant to male hormones and appear throughout life as women.

3) What about males with low levels of 5-alpha-reductase? They are XY but appear as girls until puberty around 12 yrs, when they grow penises and testes descend. This is an inherited genetic disease in some small populations. They often go on to live as heterosexual males. Interestingly they quite often say they felt like boys all along.

4) What does Senator Antic think about hermaphrodites born with both male and female gonads? Or pseudohermaphrodites with the gonads of one sex and the phenotype of the other? Are they men or women?

5) Or is one only a woman if one can bear children? Doesn't that open a can of worms?

The answer to the question "what is the definition of a woman?" may seem simple to the simple-minded and ignorant but needs to be discussed with sensitivity and scientific knowledge. To do otherwise makes the government look ignorant, insensitive and incompetent. Liberal candidates vying for election in the upcoming election may also benefit from learning more about gender issues.

Thank you for your consideration of this matter,

Regards,

s47F

s47F

From: s47F
To: [MURPHY, Brendan](#)
Subject: Congratulations
Date: Monday, 13 June 2022 7:30:35 PM

REMINDER: Think before you click! This email originated from outside our organisation. Only click links or open attachments if you recognise the sender and know the content is safe.
Amazing you have been honoured today with the companion of the order of Australia and you can't define what is a woman.

s47F

THIS DOCUMENT HAS BEEN RELEASED UNDER
THE FREEDOM OF INFORMATION ACT 1982
BY THE DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH

From: s22
 To: MURPHY, Brendan <Brendan.Murphy@health.gov.au>
 Cc: RISHNIW, Tania <Tania.Rishniw@health.gov.au>
 Subject: RE: herald Sun article [SEC: OFFICIAL]
 Date: Friday, 24 June 2022 9:36:22 AM

Thanks Brendan.

s22 can you pls send through a copy of the QON and answer so we re on the same page?

From: MURPHY, Brendan <Brendan.Murphy@health.gov.au>

Sent: Thursday, 23 June 2022 11:20 PM

To: s22 <s22@health.gov.au>; s22 <s22@health.gov.au>; s22 <s22@health.gov.au>

Cc: RISHNIW, Tania <Tania.Rishniw@health.gov.au>; News <news@health.gov.au>; s22 <s22@health.gov.au>; s22 <s22@health.gov.au>

Subject: herald Sun article [SEC: OFFICIAL]

You probably have seen or will see this. This was one of the Departmental QONs that we have tabled in recent days. s47C

s47C

If we get further media we will say nothing to add beyond the tabled response

Brendan Murphy
 Secretary
 Dept. Health

----- Forwarded message -----

From: s47F <s47F@health.gov.au>
 Date: 23 June 2022 at 11:04:33 pm AEST
 Subject: 78 word definition of woman slammed as 'drivel'
 To: MURPHY, Brendan <Brendan.Murphy@health.gov.au>

REMINDER: Think before you click! This email originated from outside our organisation. Only click links or open attachments if you recognise the sender and know the content is safe.

<https://www.heraldsun.com.au/news/victoria/health-chief-slammed-for-lengthy-definition-of-a-woman/news-story/6bd63b78e6dbb05c7b61fe2b71da0a61>



Brendan Murphy

[SEC: OFFICIAL]



s47F

24 April 2022

Dr Brendan Murphy
Secretary
Department of Health
GPO Box 9848
CANBERRA ACT 2601

Dear Dr Murphy

What is a women?

I refer to the recent Senate Estimates where that horrible nasty Senator Alex Antic asked you and your fellow Department of Health colleague's the following question:

"Can someone please provide me with a definition of what a woman is?"

I note that you could not answer the Senator's question and stated that *"I think perhaps to give a more fulsome answer we should take that on notice."*

Now I would in Hanlon's words *"never attribute to malice that which is adequately explained by stupidity"* but then I remembered that you are in fact a Doctor of Medicine. In fact, I am reliably informed by the Department of Health's website¹ that you are:

- a Professorial Associate with the title of Professor at the University of Melbourne
- an Adjunct Professor at Monash University and at the Australian National University
- a Fellow of the Australian Academy of Health and Medical Sciences
- a Fellow of the Royal Australian College of Physicians
- a Fellow of the Australian Institute of Company Directors.

So whilst you, like Judge Ketanji Brown Jackson, are not a biologist you of all people with your education and background could quite easily have been able answer Senator Antic's question without any assistance or deferral to On Notice.

I note that you will now have to assign some minion in the Department of Health the task of answering what would appear to be quite a straightforward question. If I may provide some assistance, you could simply go to Google or some other search engine and look it up and you or you minion will find the following:

¹ [Leadership | Australian Government Department of Health](#)



woman

/ˈwʊmən/

noun

an adult female human being.
"a drawing of a young woman"

Similar: lady ~~aid of female~~ female girl person lass lassie wife ▼

- a female member of a workforce, team, etc.
"thousands of women were laid off"
- a female person associated with a particular place, activity, or occupation.
"she was the first Oxford woman to take a first in Physics"

I do hope that is of assistance and please note that its free of charge. God knows how much you are being paid but surely it must be significantly more than the current APS6 wage.

I trust this information is of assistance and if you ever get another curly question at Senate Estimates you could do an Adam Bandt and tell those nasty elected officials to "GOOGLE IT!" if you don't know the answer or are too frightened of being lambasted by some transgender woke liberal.

Regards

s47F

THIS DOCUMENT HAS BEEN RELEASED UNDER
THE FREEDOM OF INFORMATION ACT 1982
BY THE DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH